

# The Economic Future of Nuclear Power

*Presentation to the  
Conference on Cost-Effective Carbon Restrictions*

*Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago  
Detroit, Michigan  
October 15, 2007*

*By*

*George S. Tolley*

*Professor Emeritus of Economics  
University of Chicago*

*Donald W. Jones*

*Vice President  
RCF, Inc.*



# The Economic Future of Nuclear Power

- Study requested by Under Secretary and Director of the Office of Nuclear Energy
- What will it take for nuclear power to enter the marketplace?
- Objective analysis—not policy recommendations



# White Paper Approach

- Business financial spreadsheet used to compare:
  - Nuclear, gas, and coal costs
  - Effects of assistance policies on business decisions
- Scenarios:
  - Capital costs
  - Effects of risk on required stock and bond returns
  - Plant construction time
  - Federal tax provisions
  - Other financial variables
- First versus later plants
  - First-of-a-kind engineering (FOAKE) costs
  - Learning effects on construction costs
  - Regulatory experience
- Comprehensive study of the future of nuclear power



# Outline of Full Study

(available at <http://www.rcfecon.com/NucEconFull.pdf>)

## Part One: Economic Competitiveness of Nuclear Energy

1. Levelized Costs of Baseload Alternatives
2. International Comparisons
3. Capital Costs
4. Learning by Doing
5. Financing Issues

## Part Two: Outlook for Nuclear Energy's Competitors

6. Gas and Coal Technologies
7. Fuel Prices
8. Environmental Policies

## Part Three: Nuclear Energy in the Years Ahead

9. Nuclear Energy Scenarios: 2015\*
10. Nuclear Energy Scenarios: Beyond 2015

## Background Studies

\*Focus of today's presentation



# Peer Review: Provided Up-to-Date Information

---

- Industrial Leaders
  - Legal
  - Technical
  - Financial
- National Laboratory
- Department of Energy



# Nuclear Energy Scenarios: 2015

- Key Findings
- New Nuclear Plants if No Policy Assistance
- Nuclear Assistance Policies
- Greenhouse Prospects
- Later Nuclear Plants
- Summary: The Major Influences on the Cost of Nuclear Energy



# Key Findings



# Key Findings

- Without federal financial policies, the first new nuclear plants coming on line will have a levelized cost of electricity (LCOE) that ranges from \$47 to \$71 per megawatt-hour (MWh), compared to \$33 to \$41 for coal-fired plants and \$35 to \$45 for gas-fired plants
- Once engineering costs are paid and the first few plants have been built, the 4<sup>th</sup> or 5<sup>th</sup> new nuclear plants could have costs as low as \$33 per MWh
- Federal financial policies combining a 20% investment tax credit and an \$18 per MWh production tax credit for 8 years could lower first-plant nuclear costs to \$25 to \$45 MWh





# New Nuclear Plants if No Policy Assistance



# Nuclear Generation Costs for 1<sup>st</sup> Plants, \$ per MWh

		<b>Overnight Cost</b>			
		\$1,200 per kW		\$1,800 per kW	
<b>5-year construction period</b>					
		Plant Life		Plant Life	
		40 years	60 years	40 years	60 years
85% Capacity		<b>47</b>	47	62	61
<b>7-year construction period</b>					
		Plant Life		Plant Life	
		40 years	60 years	40 years	60 years
85% Capacity		53	53	<b>71</b>	70



# Coal-Fired Generation Costs

	Overnight Cost			
	\$1,182 per kW		\$1,460 per kW	
	Coal Price, \$ per MMBtu			
	1.02	1.23	1.02	1.23
	Generation Cost, \$ per MWh			
2-yr construction	<b>33</b>	35	36	39
3-yr construction	34	36	37	40
4-yr construction	35	37	37	<b>41</b>



# Gas-Fired Generation Costs

	Overnight Cost			
	\$500 per kW		\$700 per kW	
	Gas price, \$ per MMBtu			
	3.39	4.25 & varying over forecast <sup>a</sup>	3.39	4.25 & varying over forecast <sup>a</sup>
	Generation Cost, \$ per MWh			
1-yr construction	<b>35</b>	42	37	44
2-yr construction	35	42	38	<b>45</b>

<sup>a</sup> EIA forecast. Beginning with a price forecast of \$4.25 per MMBtu in 2015, a peak of \$4.51 is reached in 2021, from which the forecast falls to \$4.48 by 2025, at which level it remains for the remainder of the plant life.



# Range of Costs

- 1st Nuclear: \$47/MWh to \$71/MWh
- Gas-fired: \$35/MWh to \$45/MWh
- Coal-fired: \$33/MWh to \$41/MWh



# Nuclear Assistance Policies



# Costs for 1<sup>st</sup> New Nuclear Plants With a Combination of Policies, \$ per MWh

(20% ITC, \$18/MWh PTC for 8 years)

		Overnight Cost			
		\$1,200 per kW		\$1,800 per kW	
<b>5-year construction period</b>					
		Plant Life		Plant Life	
		40 years	60 years	40 years	60 years
85% Capacity		<b>25</b>	25	37	37
<b>7-year construction period</b>					
		Plant Life		Plant Life	
		40 years	60 years	40 years	60 years
85% Capacity		31	30	46	<b>45</b>



# Greenhouse Prospects

---

- The results have assumed no additional fossil emissions controls
- Carbon controls would change the competitive balance





# Fossil Cost per MWh With and Without Greenhouse Gas Policies (\$)

	Current Environmental Policies	Greenhouse Gas Policy
Coal-fired	33 - 41	83 - 91
Gas-fired	35 - 45	58 - 68

Note: 1<sup>st</sup> plant Nuclear cost/MWh with no policy assistance 53 - 71

N<sup>th</sup> plant Nuclear cost/MWh with learning only 42 - 58



# Later Nuclear Plants

- Preceding results are for initial plants
- Costs for later plants would be reduced by:
  - Pay-down of FOAKE costs
  - Learning effects reduce construction costs
  - Favorable regulatory experience



# Later Nuclear Plants: Factors Contributing to Cost Reduction

- Pay-down of \$300 per kW in FOAKE costs
- Cost reduction from learning of 3 to 5 percent for plant doubling
- Favorable construction and regulatory experiences:
  - Financiers accept 5-year construction time for planning purposes
  - Risk premium of 3 percentage points above coal and gas construction eliminated
  - Debt-equity ratios rise from 50-50 to as high as 70-30



# Generation Costs of Later Nuclear Plants: Learning, Shorter Construction Time, Reduced Risk Premium, and Increase in Debt Ratio

Plant	Scenario				Initial Overnight Cost					
	FOAKE Costs, status	Construction Time	Risk Premium	Debt Share of Financing	\$1,200 per kW		\$1,500 per kW		\$1,800 per kW	
					Cost Reduction from Learning					
					3%	5%	3%	5%	3%	5%
					LCOE (\$ per MWh)					
1	<i>Already paid on \$1,200 plant.</i>	<i>7 years</i>	<i>3%</i>	<i>50%</i>	53	53	62	62	71	71
2	<i>All paid</i>	<i>7 years</i>	<i>3%</i>	<i>50%</i>	51	51	51	51	60	59
3	<i>All paid</i>	<i>5 years</i>	<i>3%</i>	<i>50%</i>	45	44	45	44	52	51
4	<i>All paid</i>	<i>5 years</i>	<i>Gone</i>	<i>50%</i>	36	35	36	35	41	40
5	<i>All paid</i>	<i>5 years</i>	<i>Gone</i>	<i>60%</i>	<b>34</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>37</b>
7	<i>All paid</i>	<i>5 years</i>	<i>Gone</i>	<i>70%</i>	<b>32</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>35</b>



# The Major Influences on the Cost of Nuclear Power

---

- Risk Premium
- Construction Time
- Overnight Costs

