Future State Business Tax Reforms: Perspectives from the Business, Government, and Academic Communities

Lessons Learned - Ohio

Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago
Chicago, Illinois
September 17, 2007

Thomas M. Zaino, JD, CPA
McDonald Hopkins LLC
Suite 3650, 41 South High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 458-0025
tzaino@mcdonaldhopkins.com
Lessons Learned - Agenda

- Background on Ohio and Its Tax Reform Efforts
- Overview of the Reform and the Commercial Activity Tax (the “CAT”)
- Why It Works and Lessons Learned
Background on Ohio and Its Tax Reform Efforts
Ohio . . . an Economic Powerhouse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1964</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Tax Rate (State Only)</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangible Personal Property Listing %</td>
<td>50%-70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Cities with an Income Tax</td>
<td>~130</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ohio’s Declining Economic Performance

- From 1990 – 2001, Ohio ranked 9th lowest among states in the rate of growth of the overall economy
  - 20% below average for all states

- Growth in manufacturing (nearly 25% of Ohio’s economy) was 40% U.S. average

- Job growth was 20% below national average
State Economic Growth: 1990 - 2001
(Gross State Product)

Source: Ohio Business Roundtable
Ohio . . . 40 Years of Tax Changes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table Title</th>
<th>1964</th>
<th>2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Tax Rate (State Only)</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangible Personal Property Listing %</td>
<td>50%-70%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Cities with an Income Tax</td>
<td>~130</td>
<td>~540</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ohio Business Roundtable

• CEO-driven business organization, representing Ohio’s largest companies
  – Tax reform was the #1 issue for 80 of Ohio’s largest companies

• Project team included tax professionals from around Ohio and from member companies

• Developed economic models to evaluate tax changes and impact on the economy
  – Retained: Ernst & Young, LLP
Overview of the Reform

and the

Commercial Activity Tax
Overview of the Reform – Beg. 7/1/05

- Commercial Activity Tax Phased-In
  - Over 5 Years

- Tangible Personal Property Tax Elimination
  - Over 3 Years

- Corporation Franchise Tax Elimination
  - Over 5 Years

- 21% Personal Income Tax Cut
  - Over 5 Years
40 Years Later . . . Plus 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1964</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>5.925%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Income Tax Rate (HMR)</td>
<td>Zero</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>Zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales Tax Rate (State Only)</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangible Personal Property Listing %</td>
<td>50%-70%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>Zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Cities with an Income Tax</td>
<td>~130</td>
<td>~540</td>
<td>~540</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Business View

• Many businesses supported Governor Taft’s tax reform package
  - Generally larger businesses with large Ohio base of operations or corporate headquarters
  - Generally businesses paying lots of corporation franchise tax and tangible personal property tax
Business View

• Many businesses did not support the Governor’s tax reform package
  – Some very large businesses with non-Ohio headquarters
    • Less CFT and TPP tax
    • Little PIT benefit
  – High-volume, low margin businesses
    • Market driven companies
CAT Calculation

“Taxable Gross Receipts”
X 0.0026
Full CAT
X Phase-in Percentage
Phased-In CAT
- CAT Credits
CAT Due*

* Must add $150 Minimum Tax.
Entities Subject to CAT

- Individuals
- Corporations
- S Corporations
- QSSS
- Partnerships
- LLCs and LLPs
- Firms
- Companies

- Estates
- Trusts
- Disregarded Entities
- Joint ventures
- Associations
- Societies
- Clubs
Some Entities Not Subject to CAT

- Any person with $150,000 or less of taxable gross receipts.
- Certain public utilities
- Banks, other financial institutions, and their affiliates
- Domestic or foreign insurance companies.
- Nonprofit organizations
Some Exclusions from Gross Receipts

- Interest, except on credit sales.
- Dividends.
- Wages.
- Distributive shares of PTE income.
- Amounts received from sale, exchange or disposition of section 1221 or 1231 property.
Why It Works

and the

Lessons Learned
Why It Works

- Ohio did “Economic Reform”
  - Not “Tax Reform”

- Ohio’s Reform Resulted in a Tax Cut for most businesses and Ohioans
Ohio – FY 2010

- Gross state product will increase by $5.6 billion.
- Personal income will increase by $3.6 billion.
- 78,500 new jobs will be created.
- An additional $6.3 billion in real fixed capital investment will be injected into the economy.
- Plus, $401 million in new state tax revenue will be generated.
- Per ODT, projected net tax reduction of $3.8 billion of tax.
Why It Works

- CAT has Serious Issues, But Offset in Ohio by:
  - Elimination of Tangible Property Tax and the Corporation Franchise Tax
    - Business Tax reduction of $1.5 billion in 2010 (net of CAT)
  - Very Low Rate
  - Significant Personal Income Tax Cuts
    - $2.3 billion less tax in 2010
Reform – Lessons Learned

• Business buy-in and data is crucial to true reform.
  – Format (i.e., taxing investment v. taxing consumption).
  – Benefits (i.e., net cuts or revenue neutrality).

• Economic reform, not tax reform.

• Focus on quality principles – system should be competitive, simple, stable, fair and neutral.
  – Everyone can agree on these.

• Don’t try to make everyone happy—but make a lot of folks happy!