Measuring State and Local Indebtedness: How Much is too Much?

Discussion: Leslie McGranahan, Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago

Current State Government Debt in Historical Perspective

The opinions expressed in this document are those of the author and do not represent the opinions of the Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago or of the Federal Reserve System.
Debt Levels

![Graph showing debt levels over years. The x-axis represents years from 1850 to 2000, and the y-axis represents debt levels ranging from 0 to 1500. Two lines are present: one for State Debt, Census (Bill 2006 $) and another for Local Debt, Census (Bill 2006 $). The graph indicates a significant increase in debt levels over time.](image-url)
Debt/GDP

The graph shows the Debt/GDP ratio from 1850 to 2000 for different categories: State, Local, and State and Local. The ratios are represented over time, with a peak in the mid-1950s for the State and Local category.
Debt/GDP With Federal

![Graph showing the Debt/GDP ratio over years with different categories: Debt/GDP State, Census; Debt/GDP Local, Census; Debt/GDP State and Local, Census; Debt/GDP Federal, Treasury (Debt Held by Public); Debt/GDP, State, Local, Federal.](image-url)
Debt Shares

Federal Share of Govt Debt
Local Share of Govt Debt
State Share of Govt Debt
Illinois vs. National Average, Debt per Capita

![Graph showing the comparison of Illinois State Debt Per Capita and National Average Debt Per Capita over time (1850-2000). The graph highlights a significant increase in the debt per capita for the state of Illinois, compared to the national average.](image-url)
State Debt Crisis of the 1830s & 1840s

- In 1841, state government debt/GDP 12%, as compared to 7% in 2008
- States took on debts for internal improvements (canals and railroads) and banking.
  - Jacksonian era of little Federal government meets Manifest destiny
- As of 1838, 18 of the then 26 states had debts totaling $171 M
  - “Of all the states that launched out upon the sea of internal improvements prior to 1840, Indiana, Illinois, and Michigan had the most canvas spread and the least ballast; and of these three Illinois drew the least water.” (Canvas to spread – larger sails; ballast – materials to stabilize the ship)
State Debt Crisis of the 1830s & 1840s

• Panic of 1837
  – Led to deflation. Bad for debt issuers.
  – Projects were unable to earn anticipated returns
    • Some were left unfinished. Also, due to a decline in demand.
  – Banks were unable to pay interest on the bonds that were issued for their benefit.
  – Nine states defaulted (1841-2), five of these repudiated all or most (MS, FL, AR, MI, LA), two renegotiated (IN, IL), two ultimately paid (MD and PA). Several other states barely avoided it.
State Debt Crisis of the 1830s & 1840s

- Creditors argued for federal government assumption of debts
  - Actually got very little traction
- Similarities and differences vs. today
  - Ownership
    - Debt was primarily owned abroad
      - Defaulting on the British and Dutch
    - Debt today primarily owned by domestic individuals directly or through funds.
      - Tax Deduction. BABs may change this.
  - State revenue sources
    - Pretty limited at the time. Almost no direct taxation.
    - Income tax, sales tax.
  - Federal government debt situation
    - Federal government had almost no debt of its own
    - Now Federal government has lots of debt
  - Federal government was weak
    - Union not a given
    - Union now a given
  - Federal government had not figured out how to satisfy loser and winner states
    - “Let the States, in the management of their State policy and local concerns, look to and rely upon their own resources, and never from any temporary consideration or embarrassment, be induced to supplicate this Government for pecuniary aid, which will result in impairing that lofty spirit of self-reliance and independence which is absolutely necessary to high self-respect” (Senator Lumpkin, D-GA, 1839)
    - Federal government now transfers to states all the time – Medicaid, highway funds.
Legacy of the State Debt Crisis of the 1830s & 1840s

• Restrictions on issuance in state constitutions
  – Rhode Island in 1843: “The general assembly shall have no power, hereafter, without the express consent of the people, to incur state debts to an amount exceeding fifty thousand dollars, except in time of war, or in case of insurrection or invasion; nor shall they in any case, without consent, pledge the faith of the state for the payment of the obligations of others.”
  – Prior to this, no mention of debt other than treatment of debtors.
• 1896 only 10 of 45 states had no limit on how much debt the legislature could issue without consent of the people.
• Illinois
  – 1848 & 1870: “no other debt .. shall be contracted, unless the law authorizing the same shall, at a general election, have been submitted to the people and have received a majority of the votes cast for members of the general assembly at such election.”
  – 1970: “State debt for specific purposes may be incurred or the payment of State or other debt guaranteed in such amounts as may be provided either in a law passed by the vote of three-fifths of the members elected to each house of the General Assembly or in a law approved by a majority of the electors voting on the question at the next general election following passage.”
• Did these restrictions matter? Do these restrictions matter? (Preliminary results)
  – Modest effect on debt levels 1913-1950
  – Substantial effect on debt levels 1950-1970
  – Large effect on GO debt 1970+