Real and Imaginary Resolution Options for Large Financial Institutions

> David A. Skeel, Jr. 11 November 2011



# Why so little consideration of bankruptcy?



"Ladies and gentlemen, is there a bankruptcy attorney on board?"



## What did we get instead?



"These new regulations will fundamentally change the way we get around them."

## Roadmap

1) Dodd-Frank Resolution (aka OLA, Title II)
2) Bankruptcy
3) Bail-in (regulator and automatic)
4) Reforms (herein of Chapter 14)

## 1) Dodd-Frank Resolution

The Scheme:
"Three keys turn"
Managers removed if responsible
SHs, creditors take losses
"Must" liquidate

 "All financial companies put into receivership under this title shall be liquidated." DFA section 214

#### Misconceptions at origin

 Dubious analogy to FDIC resolution of small/medium sized banks
 Liquidation unlikely
 (see recent FDIC statements)

## Problems

Untimely initiation
Nontransparent, little judicial review
Moral hazard
Expertise (can the FDIC run a major bank?)

#### Benefits

 Ability to intervene quickly with substantial funding
 Prior regulatory knowledge
 Global regulatory coordination

## Bankruptcy

The Process:
Automatic stay

Exception: derivatives, repos

Sale of assets and/or negotiate terms of reorganization

Creditor vote

#### **Benefits**

Rule of law virtues
Curbs moral hazard
Parties themselves make the key decisions

## **Bankruptcy's Limitations**

Doesn't focus on systemic risk
 No immediate funding source
 How serious are these concerns?

## Limitations of Bankruptcy Judge

Limited information at outset
 Limits of Article I (vs. III) status
 Independence deficit? (14 year terms)
 Jurisdiction deficit? (Stern v. Marshall)

## 3) Is Bail-in the Solution?

 Origins of the term: sovereign debt
 Meaning: creditors take haircuts
 How different from Dodd-Frank or BR?

- Preserve the institution
- Regulators' discretion channeled
- NB: can be done in Dodd-Frank (e.g., Guynn (2011))

# Limitations of Administrator Bailin

 Administrators still must decide who is and isn't protected (unless triggers are automatic)

Timeliness of initiation uncertain

#### Automatic triggers

Obvious triggers (e.g., capital-based) can be gamed Manipulation of triggers Greece e.g. doesn't bode well for this approach Overview of a similar debate in the bankruptcy literature: Skeel (1993)

# 4) Reforms?

- Simple:
- I) Remove "thou shalt liquidate" provision
- 2) Presumption that "living will" will be followed
- 3) Presumption that cases in bankruptcy will stay there
   4) Stay on derivatives in BR

## Chapter 14

1) Regulators given standing and power to file involuntary BR 2) Funding rules amended to allow prepayments 3) Judge chosen from panel of Article III judges (and authorized to use masters) Cf. Bliss-Kaufman (2011)