Innovation & Regulation

Michael S. Barr
Roy F. and Jean Humphrey Proffitt Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School
Professor of Public Policy, Ford School of Public Policy
Faculty Director, Center on Finance, Law, and Policy
November 4, 2016
Innovation & Regulation

- Central to growth but hides new risks
- Innovation is inherently disruptive
- Cycles of history
- Dangers (in both directions)
  - Miss systemic risks
  - Lock in dinosaurs
Financial Stability

• Theory
• Risk data
• Risk analytics
• Risk management (structure, incentives, supervision, etc.)
• Authority & will to act

Innovation disrupts all of these.
Analytics

- Metrics
- Counter-factual (stress testing)
- Matrix
- Networks
- Complex systems
- Agent-based modeling
- Crowdsourcing
- Analogies (e.g., evolutionary biology)
  - Adaptive, Modular, Redundant, Diverse
Challenges

- Are capital levels high enough? Simple enough? Risk-based enough? Macro enough?
- Who holds TLAC? What about knock-on effects?
- Global coordination (capital, resolution, derivatives)
- CCPs
- SFT haircuts & collateral rules, triparty repo
- Shadow banking (MMFs, GSEs, Wholesale Funding, Hedge Funds, Asset Management)
- Cumulative, interactive effects of complex regulation
- Values: accountability, transparency, democracy
Regulating in Uncertainty: Innovation

- When and how will regulators balance innovation and risk?
  - ETFs
    - ETFs can be diversified & tax efficient but also can be prone to runs
    - Synthetic and inverse derivatives amplify and spread risk
  - High-Frequency Trading
    - High-Frequency Trading adds liquidity but does it undermine financial market stability? Fairness? Efficiency?
  - FinTech
    - Consumer protection, payments, bank charter?
What is the frame?

• Idiosyncratic vs. systemic risk
  – What is the tradeoff between islanding and adaptability?

• Banking and shadow banking
  – What is the regulatory perimeter?

• National and International
  – Who’s in charge of global finance?
Five Ways The Financial System Will Fail Next Time

• Amnesia (leverage, liquidity, bubbles)
• Regulatory arbitrage
• Analytic & management failure
• Innovation/disruption
• Choices & accidents
Five Things We Don’t Know

• What we once knew but have now forgotten
• What is knowable but is kept hidden
• What we know, but don’t know what it means
• What we don’t know that we don’t know
• What we should do about things we know
Building a More Resilient Financial System

- Vertical buffers
- Horizontal buffers
- Regulatory checks and balances
- Transparency
- Accountability
- Corporate governance
- Monetary, fiscal, regulatory, tax, social welfare policies
- Resiliency vs. other values (cost, growth, access, innovation)
Regulatory Innovation

• Crowdsourcing
• Smart defaults
• Private sector pilots with safe harbors
  – CFPB Project Catalyst
  – UK FCA
  – OCC Office of Innovation
• Data innovations
  – LEI
  – Consumer ownership of financial data in machine-readable form
Regulation Innovation: the case of consumer financial services

- Goal: competition, innovation, meeting needs of consumers & businesses
- Consumer ownership of financial data
- Data package of identity, usage & relationships
- Account switching
- Overdraft regulation
- Good funds availability
- Instant payments
- KYC/AML
- Payments systems rules & procedures
Regulatory Innovation

• Reg Tech
• Regulatory Sandbox
• Big Data & Big Analytics