Secular stagnation and US monetary policy

US Economics

Lewis Alexander
US Chief Economist
+1-212-667-9665
Lewis.Alexander@nomura.com

November 10, 2015
After five years of steady declines the FOMC expects the unemployment rate to stabilize near its estimates of the “natural rate.”

How far will rates have to increase to hit this forecast for the unemployment rate?

What factors will determine how far rates have to rise?

Source: BLS, Federal Reserve and Nomura Economics
We can estimate the ERIR by asking what level of interest rates seems consistent with the economy growing at its potential.

The most well-known model is Laubach and Williams (2003).

Other approaches:
- Use different measures of the output gap;
- Take into account financial conditions (Kiley (2015));
- Use time-varying parameters in a VAR (Lubik and Matthes (2015))

Most of these approaches suggest that the ERIR:
- Declined sharply during the “Great Recession.”
- Has increased little thereafter.
### Alternative estimates of the equilibrium real interest rate (R*) during economic recoveries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Output Gap</th>
<th>Unemployment Gap</th>
<th>Simple Alternatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983q1-1990q3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>R*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>s.e.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991q2-2000q4</td>
<td>R*</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>s.e.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002q1-2007q4</td>
<td>R*</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>s.e.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009q3-2015q2</td>
<td>R*</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>s.e.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Last</td>
<td>R*</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>s.e.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Simple alternatives are estimated using a simplified version of the Kalman filter techniques used by Laubach-Williams and alternative measures of "slack." See slide 15. The time-varying-parameter (TVP-VAR) is from Lubik and Matthes (2015). Source: Laubach and Williams (2003), Kiley (2015), Lubik and Matthes (2015), and Nomura Economics.
The “natural rate” of interest is generally defined as the rate consistent with the economy operating in equilibrium (full employment) in the absence of price distortions.

Note that the “natural rate” moves in response to the shocks that affect the economy.

Since the “Great Recession” estimates of the natural rate have generally been negative and well below estimates of the ERIR.

Estimates of the “natural rate” are sensitive to the specification of the model.
Are rates going to return to “normal”?

- Estimates of the ERIR and the “natural rate” of interest fell sharply during the “Great Recession.”
- They have not recovered.
- This raises the question of whether or not the shocks that have lowered interest rates are temporary or permanent.

Note: The natural rate of interest is estimated forecasted going forward based on data available through the end of 2006, 2008, 2010 and 2012, and through 2015q2. Estimates and forecasts are based on the DSGE model presented Curdia, Ferrero, Ng, and Tambalotti (2015). Source: Curdia (2015) and Nomura Economics.
What does the data tell us?

- Equilibrium interest rate concepts – the ERIR and the “natural” rate of interest – are not stable
  - A variety of estimation techniques show considerable variation

- Equilibrium interest rates fell substantially at the time of the “Great Recession.”

- But equilibrium interest rates were declining before the “Great Recession.”
  - Weak recoveries following recessions in 1991 and 2001 may have been early consequences of some of the factors that are holding down interest rates now.

- Equilibrium interest rates have recovered little since the “Great Recession.”

- Our quantitative estimates of equilibrium interest rates are very uncertain.
  - Kiley estimates that 80% of changes in priors about R* pass through to the posterior distribution.
  - “These results suggest that researchers with alternative prior views about the degree to which r* has shifted over time are unlikely to be swayed by the information in the relationship between output and short-term interest rates—there is simply too little information in such co-movement over the past 50 years to provide much guidance.” Kiley (2015)
The current FOMC forecast implies that they expect to close the gap with current estimates of the ERIR by early 2017.

Beyond that, additional hikes will depend on increases in the ERIR.

Ultimately, the FOMC will be constrained by what the economy can handle.
A non-exhaustive list of possible explanations

- Headwinds – an unfortunate sequence of shocks that will dissipate over time.

- Slowdown in potential growth
  - Slower growth in labor input
  - Slower growth in multifactor productivity

- Demographic effects on savings
  - Longer lifespans and earlier retirement increase the need for private savings

- Global savings glut
  - High rates of savings in fast-growing emerging economies

- “Shortage” of high-quality assets

- IT and investment
  - Falling relative price of capital goods
  - Changing nature of innovation

Source: Nomura Economics
Recent declines in interest rates may reflect a series of shocks that have suppressed aggregate demand rather than some new persistent trend.

In the wake of the “Great Recession” the US economy has had to deal with a number of shocks.

- A correction in residential construction
- Balance sheet repair for households and financial institutions
- The European crisis
- Fiscal consolidation
- Weak foreign growth and the appreciation of the dollar

This adjustment process may be typical – in its broad effects, rather than the details – of recoveries following deep financial crises.

The apparent decline of equilibrium interest rates before the “Great Recession” undermines the strong form of the “headwinds” explanation.

- It is noteworthy that the use of the word “headwinds” in this context was popularized by Alan Greenspan to described the weak recovery following the recession in 1991.
The recent performance of interest rates comes at a time when aggregate supply is growing very slowly.

The pace of growth has slowed for:

- Hours worked
- Multifactor productivity
- The contribution of capital deepening to business sector productivity

In recent decades, prices for capital goods have fallen relative to prices for consumer goods.

The biggest single explanation is the decline in the price of IT equipment.

In recent years the pace of decline has seemed to slow.

- But this probably reflects inadequacies in the way the BLS and BEA capture improvements in basic semiconductors.

Source: BEA and Nomura Economics.
Investment in conventional plant and equipment has become less important for US companies.

For the 250 largest non-financial companies, ratio of the value of plant and equipment to the book value of assets has fallen substantially.

The median has fallen by more than two thirds over the last thirty years.

Net lending by the non-financial corporate sector has turned positive since 2000.
A few final thoughts (for me)

- Recent declines in interest rates probably reflect multiple factors
  - Alternative explanations are not, for the most part, mutually exclusive.

- What’s going to change?
  - Will the slowdown in China and other emerging economies, and the associated declines in commodity prices, reduce the “global savings glut”?
  - Will a decline in the pace of reserve accumulation reverse, at least somewhat, the “shortage” of high quality assets?
  - Will new products emerge that boost investment by businesses and households (driverless cars, for example)?

- How should the uncertainty about the current level of the ERIR, and its likely evolution, affect FOMC decision making?

Source: Nomura Economics
Other material
Simple approach to estimating $R^*$

**Basic equation**

$$GAP_t = \beta_1 GAP_{t-1} + \beta_2 GAP_{t-2} + \beta_3 (RR_{t-1} - R^*)$$

Where:

- $GAP_t \equiv$ Output or unemployment rate gap
- $RR_t \equiv$ Ex ante real interest rate

- This equation can be estimated using latent variable (Kalman filter) techniques.

- This simple approach tracks the Laubach-Williams estimates when their estimate of the output gap is used.

- Alternative measures of either the output gap (from the Fleischman-Roberts model) or unemployment rate gap (from either Fleischman-Roberts or CBO) yield lower estimates of $R^*$ in recent years.

Source: Laubach and Williams (2003), Fleischman and Roberts (2011), and Nomura Economics
Policy rules with uncertainty

- **Taylor Rule**

\[ R_t = r^* + \pi_t + \beta_\pi (\pi_t - \hat{\pi}) + \beta_y (U_t - \hat{U}_t) \]

- The Taylor rule depends on two constants that are hard to measure, i.e., the equilibrium real rate of interest and the natural rate of unemployment.

- **Difference Rule**

\[ R_t = R_{t-1} + \beta_\pi (\pi_t - \hat{\pi}) + \beta_y (U_t - U_{t-1}) \]

- A “difference” rule depends only on observable variables.

- “Difference” rules may be more robust in the face of uncertainty about \( R^* \)

Source: Nomura Economics
A simple look at the data: Real interest rate and changes in the unemployment rate gap

Before 2001 there appeared to be a relatively stable relationship between the real interest rate and the unemployment rate gap.

- The implied ERIR was about 2.9%.

Source: Nomura Economics
A simple look at the data:
Real interest rate and changes in the unemployment rate gap

- Since 2001 it appears that ERIR has declined.
  - The implied ERIR was about 0.1%.

- Key question right now:
  - How stimulative, in a macroeconomic sense, is policy?

Source: Nomura Economics


Vasco Cúrdia, Andrea Ferrero, Ging Cee Ng, and Andrea Tambalotti. 2015. “Has U.S. Monetary Policy Tracked the Efficient Interest Rate?” Journal of Monetary Economics 70, pp. 72–83.


Thomas A. Lubik and Christian Matthes, “Calculating the Natural Rate of Interest: A Comparison of Two Alternative Approaches,” Economic Brief, Federal Reserve Bank of Richmond, October 2015.
Analyst Certification
I, Lewis Alexander, hereby certify (1) that the views expressed in this Research report accurately reflect my personal views about any or all of the subject securities or issuers referred to in this Research report, (2) no part of my compensation was, is or will be directly or indirectly related to the specific recommendations or views expressed in this Research report and (3) no part of my compensation is tied to any specific investment banking transactions performed by Nomura Securities International, Inc., Nomura International plc or any other Nomura Group company.

Important Disclosures
Online availability of research and conflict-of-interest disclosures
Nomura research is available on www.nomuranow.com/research, Bloomberg, Capital IQ, Factset, MarkitHub, Reuters and ThomsonOne. Important disclosures may be read at http://go.nomuranow.com/research/globalresearchportal/pages/disclosures/disclosures.aspx or requested from Nomura Securities International, Inc., on 1-877-865-5752. If you have any difficulties with the website, please email grpsupport@nomura.com for help.

The analysts responsible for preparing this report have received compensation based upon various factors including the firm's total revenues, a portion of which is generated by Investment Banking activities. Unless otherwise noted, the non-US analysts listed at the front of this report are not registered/qualified as research analysts under FINRA/NYSE rules, may not be associated persons of NSI, and may not be subject to FINRA Rule 2711 and NYSE Rule 472 restrictions on communications with covered companies, public appearances, and trading securities held by a research analyst account.

Nomura Global Financial Products Inc. ("NGFP") Nomura Derivative Products Inc. ("NDPI") and Nomura International plc. ("NIplc") are registered with the Commodities Futures Trading Commission and the National Futures Association (NFA) as swap dealers. NGFP, NDPI, and NIplc are generally engaged in the trading of swaps and other derivative products, any of which may be the subject of this report.

ADDITIONAL DISCLOSURES REQUIRED IN THE U.S.
Principal Trading: Nomura Securities International, Inc and its affiliates will usually trade as principal in the fixed income securities (or in related derivatives) that are the subject of this research report. Analyst Interactions with other Nomura Securities International, Inc. Personnel: The fixed income research analysts of Nomura Securities International, Inc and its affiliates regularly interact with sales and trading desk personnel in connection with obtaining liquidity and pricing information for their respective coverage universe.

Valuation methodology - Fixed Income
Nomura's Fixed Income Strategists express views on the price of securities and financial markets by providing trade recommendations. These can be relative value recommendations, directional trade recommendations, asset allocation recommendations, or a mixture of all three. The analysis which is embedded in a trade recommendation would include, but not be limited to:
• Fundamental analysis regarding whether a security’s price deviates from its underlying macro- or micro-economic fundamentals.
• Quantitative analysis of price variations.
• Technical factors such as regulatory changes, changes to risk appetite in the market, unexpected rating actions, primary market activity and supply/demand considerations.

The timeframe for a trade recommendation is variable. Tactical ideas have a short timeframe, typically less than three months. Strategic trade ideas have a longer timeframe of typically more than three months.

Disclaimers
This document contains material that has been prepared by the Nomura entity identified on page 1 and/or with the sole or joint contributions of one or more Nomura entities whose employees and their respective affiliations are also specified on page 1 or identified elsewhere in the document. The term "Nomura Group" used herein refers to Nomura Holdings, Inc. or any of its affiliates or subsidiaries and may refer to one or more Nomura Group companies including: Nomura Securities Co., Ltd. ("NSC") Tokyo, Japan; Nomura International plc ("NIplc"), UK; Nomura Securities International, Inc. ("NSI"), New York, US; Nomura International (Hong Kong) Ltd. ("NIHK"), Hong Kong; Nomura Financial Investment (Korea) Co., Ltd. ("NFIK"), Korea (Information on Nomura analysts registered with the Korea Financial Investment Association ("KOFIA") can be found on the KOFIA Intranet at http://dis.kofia.or.kr); Nomura Singapore Ltd. ("NSL"), Singapore (Registration number 197201440E, regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore); Nomura Australia Ltd. ("NAL"), Australia (ABN 48 003 032 513), regulated by the Australian Securities and Investment Commission ("ASIC") and holder of an Australian financial services licence number 246412; P.T. Nomura Indonesia ("PTNI"), Indonesia; Nomura Securities
by specific laws and regulations of the US or other jurisdictions, this will be separately disclosed within the specific issuer disclosures.

liquidity provider (within the meaning of applicable regulations in the UK) in the financial instruments of the issuer. Where the activity of market maker is carried out in accordance with the definition given to it

ratings, and are not responsible for any errors or omissions (negligent or otherwise), regardless of the cause, or for the results obtained from the use of such content. Third-party content providers give no

express or implied warranties, including, but not limited to, any warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose or use. Third-party content providers shall not be liable for any direct, indirect,

incidental, exemplary, compensatory, punitive, special or consequential damages, costs, expenses, legal fees, or losses (including lost income or profits and opportunity costs) in connection with any use of

their content, including ratings. Credit ratings are statements of opinions and are not statements of fact or recommendations to purchase hold or sell securities. They do not address the suitability of securities

certain securities are subject to fluctuations in exchange rates that could have an adverse effect on the value or price of, or income derived from, the investment.

future distribution of returns.

future performance, such forecasts may not be a reliable indicator of future performance. Moreover, simulations are based on models and simplifying assumptions which may oversimplify and not reflect the

level of the portfolio. Additional risks may be associated with any investment decision. Nomura Group produces a number of different types of research product including, among others, fundamental analysis and quantitative analysis;

satisfaction, where no specific recommendations are made. Nomura Group does not warrant or represent that the document is accurate, complete, reliable, fit for any particular purpose or merchantable and does not accept liability for any act (or decision not to act)

resulting from use of this document and related data. To the maximum extent permissible all warranties and other assurances by Nomura group are hereby excluded and Nomura Group shall have no liability for the use, misuse, or distribution of this information.

Opinions or estimates expressed are current opinions as of the original publication date appearing on this material and the information, including the opinions and estimates contained herein, are subject to

change without notice. Nomura Group is under no duty to update this document. Any comments or statements made herein are those of the author(s) and may differ from views held by other parties within

Nomura Group. Clients should consider whether any advice or recommendation in this report is suitable for their particular circumstances and, if appropriate, seek professional advice, including tax advice.

Nomura Group does not provide tax advice.

Nomura Group, and/or its officers, directors and employees, may, to the extent permitted by applicable law and/or regulation, deal as principal, agent, or otherwise, or have long or short positions in, or buy or

sell, the securities, commodities or instruments, or options or other derivative instruments based thereon, of issuers or securities mentioned herein. Nomura Group companies may also act as market maker or

liquidity provider (within the meaning of applicable regulations in the UK) in the financial instruments of the issuer. Where the activity of market maker is carried out in accordance with the definition given to it

by specific laws and regulations of the US or other jurisdictions, this will be separately disclosed within the specific issuer disclosures.

This document may contain information obtained from third parties, including ratings from credit ratings agencies such as Standard & Poor’s. Reproduction and distribution of third-party content in any form is

prohibited except with the prior written permission of the related third-party. Third-party content providers do not guarantee the accuracy, completeness, timeliness or availability of any information, including

ratings, and are not responsible for any errors or omissions (negligent or otherwise), regardless of the cause, or for the results obtained from the use of such content. Third-party content providers give no

express or implied warranties, including, but not limited to, any warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose or use. Third-party content providers shall not be liable for any direct, indirect,

incidental, exemplary, compensatory, punitive, special or consequential damages, costs, expenses, legal fees, or losses (including lost income or profits and opportunity costs) in connection with any use of

their content, including ratings. Credit ratings are statements of opinions and are not statements of fact or recommendations to purchase hold or sell securities. They do not address the suitability of securities

or the suitability of securities for investment purposes, and should not be relied on as investment advice.

Any MSCI sourced information in this document is the exclusive property of MSCI Inc. (‘MSCI’). Without prior written permission of MSCI, this information and any other MSCI intellectual property may not be

reproduced, re-disseminated or used to create any financial products, including any indices. This information is provided on an "as is" basis. The user assumes the entire risk of any use made of this information.

MSCI, its affiliates and any third party involved in, or related to, computing or compiling the information hereby expressly disclaim all warranties of originality, accuracy, completeness,

merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose with respect to any of this information. Without limiting any of the foregoing, in no event shall MSCI, any of its affiliates or any third party involved in, or related

to, computing or compiling the information have any liability for any damages of any kind. MSCI and the MSCI indexes are services marks of MSCI and its affiliates.

Russell/Nomura Japan Equity Indexes are protected by certain intellectual property rights of Nomura Securities Co., Ltd. and Russell Investments. Nomura Securities Co., Ltd. and Russell Investments do not

guarantee the accuracy, completeness, reliability, or usefulness thereof and do not account for business activities and services that any index user and its affiliates undertake with the use of the Indexes.

Investors should consider this document as only a single factor in making their investment decision and, as such, the report should not be viewed as identifying or suggesting all risks, direct or indirect, that

may be associated with any investment decision. Nomura Group produces a number of different types of research product including, among others, fundamental analysis and quantitative analysis;

recommendations contained in one type of research product may differ from recommendations contained in other types of research product, whether as a result of differing time horizons, methodologies or

otherwise. Nomura Group publishes research product in a number of different ways including the posting of product on Nomura Group portals and/or distribution directly to clients. Different groups of clients

may receive different products and services from the research department depending on their individual requirements.

Figures presented herein may refer to past performance or simulations based on past performance which are not reliable indicators of future performance. Where the information contains an indication of

future performance, such forecasts may not be a reliable indicator of future performance. Moreover, simulations are based on models and simplifying assumptions which may oversimplify and not reflect the

future distribution of returns.

Certain securities are subject to fluctuations in exchange rates that could have an adverse effect on the value or price of, or income derived from, the investment.
The securities described herein may not have been registered under the US Securities Act of 1933 (the ‘1933 Act’), and, in such case, may not be offered or sold in the US or to US persons unless they have been registered under the 1933 Act, or except in compliance with an exemption from the registration requirements of the 1933 Act. Unless governing law permits otherwise, any transaction should be executed via a Nomura entity in your home jurisdiction.

This document has been approved for distribution in the UK and European Economic Area as investment research by NIplc. NIplc is authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and the Prudential Regulation Authority. NIplc is a member of the London Stock Exchange. This document does not constitute a personal recommendation within the meaning of applicable regulations in the UK, or take into account the particular investment objectives, financial situations, or needs of individual investors. This document is intended only for investors who are 'eligible counterparties' or 'professional clients' for the purposes of applicable regulations in the UK, and may not, therefore, be redistributed to persons who are ‘retail clients’ for such purposes. This document has been approved by NIHK, which is regulated by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission, for distribution in Hong Kong by NIHK. This document has been approved for distribution in Australia by NAL, which is authorized and regulated in Australia by the ASIC. This document has also been approved for distribution in Malaysia by NSM. In Singapore, this document has been distributed by NSL. NSL accepts legal responsibility for the content of this document, where it concerns securities, futures and foreign exchange, issued by their foreign affiliates in respect of recipients who are not accredited, expert or institutional investors as defined by the Securities and Futures Act (Chapter 289). Recipients of this document in Singapore should contact NSL in respect of matters arising from, or in connection with, this document. Unless prohibited by the provisions of Regulation S of the 1933 Act, this material is distributed in the US, by NSI, a US-registered broker-dealer, which accepts responsibility for its contents in accordance with the provisions of Rule 15a-6, under the US Securities Exchange Act of 1934. The entity that prepared this document permits its separately operated affiliates within the Nomura Group to make copies of such documents available to their clients.

This document has not been approved for distribution to persons other than ‘Authorised Persons’, ‘Exempt Persons’ or ‘Institutions’ (as defined by the Capital Markets Authority) in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (‘Saudi Arabia’) or ‘professional clients’ (as defined by the Dubai Financial Services Authority) in the United Arab Emirates (‘UAE’) or a ‘Market Counterparty’ or ‘Business Customers’ (as defined by the Qatar Financial Centre Regulatory Authority) in the State of Qatar (‘Qatar’) by Nomura Saudi Arabia, NIplc or any other member of Nomura Group, as the case may be. Neither this document nor any copy thereof may be taken or transmitted or distributed, directly or indirectly, by any person other than those authorised to do so into Saudi Arabia or in the UAE or in Qatar or to any person other than ‘Authorised Persons’, ‘Exempt Persons’ or ‘Institutions’ located in Saudi Arabia or ‘professional clients’ in the UAE or a ‘Market Counterparty’ or ‘Business Customers’ in Qatar. By accepting to receive this document, you represent that you are not located in Saudi Arabia or that you are an ‘Authorised Person’, an ‘Exempt Person’ or an ‘Institution’ in Saudi Arabia or that you are a ‘professional client’ in the UAE or a ‘Market Counterparty’ or ‘Business Customers’ in Qatar and agree to comply with these restrictions. Any failure to comply with these restrictions may constitute a violation of the laws of the UAE or Saudi Arabia or Qatar.

NO PART OF THIS MATERIAL MAY BE (I) COPIED, PHOTOCOPIED, OR DUPLICATED IN ANY FORM, BY ANY MEANS; OR (II) REDISTRIBUTED WITHOUT THE PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT OF A MEMBER OF NOMURA GROUP. If this document has been distributed by electronic transmission, such as e-mail, then such transmission cannot be guaranteed to be secure or error-free as information could be intercepted, corrupted, lost, destroyed, arrive late or incomplete, or contain viruses. The sender therefore does not accept liability for any errors or omissions in the contents of this document, which may arise as a result of electronic transmission. If verification is required, please request a hard-copy version.

Nomura Group manages conflicts with respect to the production of research through its compliance policies and procedures (including, but not limited to, Conflicts of Interest, Chinese Wall and Confidentiality policies) as well as through the maintenance of Chinese walls and employee training.

Additional information is available upon request and disclosure information is available at the Nomura Disclosure web page:
Copyright © 2014 Nomura Securities International, Inc. All rights reserved.

Disclosures as of 01-Dec-2014.